

PETER KAHLIG, JANUSZ MATKOWSKI AND
ALEKSANDER N. SHAROVSKY

Dido's functional equation revisited

*Dedicated to Professor Zenon Moszner
on his 70th birthday*

Abstract. Applying the method of invariants ("first integrals"), an explicit form of the general solution of Dido's functional equation $2f(2x) = f(x) + \sqrt{f(x)^2 + \frac{1}{x^2}}$, related to the ancient isoperimetric problem, is determined. The general solution depends on an arbitrary positive and bounded 1-periodic function. There is a unique solution having a given finite and positive limit at infinity. This improves a result proved by a different method in a paper of the first two authors.

1. Introduction

The Dido functional equation

$$2f(2x) = f(x) + \sqrt{f(x)^2 + \frac{1}{x^2}}, \quad x > \alpha, \quad (1)$$

where $f : (\alpha, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ and $\alpha > 0$ is fixed, appears in connection with the ancient isoperimetric problem of Dido (cf. [1]). According to the legend, Queen Dido of Carthage could get such an amount of land that a bull's hide would cover. Smartly cutting the hide into one long strip, she intuitively solved the isoperimetric problem: starting with a regular triangle, say, she observed that the area would increase noticeably upon doubling the number of vertices by halving the sides of the initial triangle (obtaining a regular hexagon). Repeating this process of halving the sides of consecutive regular n -

gons, she enlarged the area at each step. This procedure leads to the functional equation (1). (For details cf. [1].)

To find the explicit form of the general solution of equation (1), we apply the *method of invariants* described in [2]. According to this method, we adjoin to the functional equation (1) a self-mapping, the so-called “characteristic map” (cf. [2]), of the first quadrant of the plane. The graph of every solution, as a subset of the first quadrant, is invariant with respect to the characteristic map, i.e. the graph consists of a family of trajectories of this map. In order to get all invariant sets which “give” (i.e. correspond to) solutions of the functional equation, it is sufficient to find a “complete collection” of independent invariant functions — in our case, two such functions. This allows to determine the general solution in explicit form (cf. Theorem 1).

As an immediate corollary we obtain Theorem 2 which says that every solution ϱ of equation (1) satisfying the condition

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \varrho(x) = a \quad (a > 0, \text{ fixed})$$

must be of the form

$$\varrho(x) = \frac{1}{x} \cot \frac{1}{ax}, \quad x \in (\alpha, \infty).$$

This improves the main result of [1] where the solution ϱ is assumed to satisfy a stronger asymptotic type regularity condition at infinity.

2. Motivation for the Dido equation and preliminary remarks

We present a sketch of the geometrical reasoning showing how the Dido functional equation appears in connection with the oldest variational problem. (For more details cf. [1].)

REMARK 1

Consider a right-angled triangle with sides of length a, b, c , such that $\max(a, b) < c$. Construct an isosceles triangle in the following way: modify the sides of length b and c to an arbitrary common value $b' = c'$; denote the length of the new base side by a' , and by m the length of the height of the isosceles triangle, orthogonal to the base side of length a' . Then (Lemma 1 in [1])

$$m = \frac{b + c}{2} \quad \text{iff} \quad a' = a.$$

Considering regular polygons of order $n \in \mathbb{N}_2 := \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\}$ with the same fixed perimeter P , and denoting by r_n the radius of the inner circle, by R_n the radius of the outer circle, and by $s_n (= \frac{P}{n})$ the length of any segment, we get

$$r_{2n} = \frac{r_n + R_n}{2} \quad \text{and} \quad R_n = \sqrt{r_n^2 + \left(\frac{s_n}{2}\right)^2} = \sqrt{r_n^2 + s_{2n}^2}.$$

These two relations imply that

$$2r_{2n} = r_n + \sqrt{r_n^2 + \left(\frac{P}{2n}\right)^2}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_2.$$

Setting

$$f(n) := \frac{2r_n}{P},$$

we can write this recurrence in the form

$$2f(2n) = f(n) + \sqrt{f(n)^2 + \frac{1}{n^2}}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_2. \tag{2}$$

Extending the domain of f to (α, ∞) where $\alpha > 0$ is a suitably chosen number, and replacing f by the corresponding function $\varrho : (\alpha, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$, we get the Dido functional equation

$$2\varrho(2x) = \varrho(x) + \sqrt{\varrho(x)^2 + \frac{1}{x^2}}, \quad x \in (\alpha, \infty).$$

In the proof of Theorem 1, for the construction of an invariant function we will need a trigonometric identity for the function arccot presented in the following

REMARK 2

The function \cot is a one-to-one mapping of $(0, \pi)$ onto $(-\infty, \infty)$, and, in particular, a mapping of $(0, \frac{\pi}{2})$ onto $(0, \infty)$. Consequently, its inverse, $\operatorname{arccot} : (-\infty, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \pi)$, maps $(0, \infty)$ onto $(0, \frac{\pi}{2})$. Since the function \sin is positive in $(0, \pi)$, we have

$$\cot \frac{x}{2} = \frac{\cos x + 1}{\sin x} = \cot x + \frac{1}{\sin x} = \cot x + \sqrt{\cot^2 x + 1}, \quad x \in (0, \pi).$$

Taking into account that $\operatorname{arccot}((0, \infty)) = (0, \frac{\pi}{2})$, we get the identity

$$\operatorname{arccot} \left(w + \sqrt{w^2 + 1} \right) = \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{arccot} w, \quad w \in (0, \infty).$$

3. General solution

The general solution of the Dido functional equation is described by the following

THEOREM 1

Let $\alpha > 0$ be arbitrarily fixed. Then a function $\varrho : (\alpha, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ satisfies the Dido functional equation (1) if and only if

$$\varrho(x) = \frac{1}{x} \cot \left[\frac{1}{x} p \left(\frac{\ln x}{\ln 2} \right) \right], \quad x \in (\alpha, \infty), \quad (3)$$

where $p : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ is a positive 1-periodic function such that

$$p(x) < \frac{\pi}{2} \cdot 2^x \quad \text{for } x \in (x_0, x_0 + 1], \quad x_0 = \frac{\ln \alpha}{\ln 2}. \quad (4)$$

Proof. Suppose that $\varrho : (\alpha, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ satisfies the functional equation (1). Multiplying this equation by x gives

$$2x\varrho(2x) = x\varrho(x) + \sqrt{[x\varrho(x)]^2 + 1}, \quad x > \alpha.$$

Hence, putting $w(x) := x\varrho(x)$, we obtain

$$w(2x) = w(x) + \sqrt{[w(x)]^2 + 1}, \quad x > \alpha. \quad (5)$$

Define a map $S : (0, \infty)^2 \rightarrow (0, \infty)^2$ by

$$S(x, w) = \left(2x, w + \sqrt{w^2 + 1} \right), \quad x, w \in (0, \infty), \quad (6)$$

and put

$$S_1(x) = 2x, \quad S_2(w) = w + \sqrt{w^2 + 1}.$$

The map S is one-to-one, $(0, \infty) \times (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty) \times (1, \infty)$. If the function $x \mapsto w(x)$, $x > \alpha$, is a solution of equation (5), then its graph, as a curve in $(0, \infty)^2$, is invariant with respect to the map $S = (S_1, S_2)$, i.e. it has to consist of the trajectories $\{S^n(x, w(x)) : x \in (\alpha, \infty), n \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Define a two-place function $J_1 : (0, \infty)^2 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ by

$$J_1(x, w) = x \cdot \operatorname{arccot} w, \quad x, w > 0.$$

Since, in view of Remark 2 and the definition of S_2 ,

$$\operatorname{arccot} \circ S_2 = \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{arccot},$$

we have, for all $x, w > 0$,

$$(J_1 \circ S)(x, w) = J_1(S_1(x), S_2(w)) = 2x \cdot \operatorname{arccot}(S_2(w)) = J_1(x, w),$$

which means that the function J_1 is S -invariant.

Thus, the set $J_1(x, w) = c$ is a curve invariant with respect to the map S (briefly, S -invariant) which “gives” the solution $w(x) = \cot \frac{c}{x}$ of equation (5), for any constant $c \in (0, \frac{\pi}{2}\alpha)$ (so that $w > 0$). But not every S -invariant curve in $(0, \infty)^2$ can be obtained as a level curve of the function J_1 .

As a second invariant function for the map S , it is possible to take any function J_2 depending only on the first variable. Then, according to the definition of S ,

$$J_2(2x) = J_2(x), \quad x > 0,$$

and this implies that J_2 is S -invariant if and only if

$$J_2(x, w) = p_0 \left(\frac{\ln x}{\ln 2} \right), \quad x, w > 0, \tag{7}$$

where $p_0 : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ is some 1-periodic function.

It is obvious that for an arbitrary function $\Phi : (0, \infty)^2 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ the function $\Phi \circ (J_1, J_2)$ is also S -invariant. It can be shown that every S -invariant curve can be represented in the form $\Phi \circ (J_1, J_2)(x, w) = 0$ (in the same way, every trajectory of S can be given by the intersection of a level curve $J_1(x, w) = c_1$ and a level curve $J_2(x) = c_2$ where c_1, c_2 are some constants).

“Resolving” the equation $\Phi(z_1, z_2) = 0$ with respect to the first argument, we get

$$J_1(x, w) = \varphi \circ J_2(x)$$

where $\varphi : (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ is an arbitrary function. We can rewrite the last equation in the following form

$$x \cdot \operatorname{arccot} w = p \left(\frac{\ln x}{\ln 2} \right)$$

where $p = \varphi \circ p_0$ is an arbitrary 1-periodic function. In this manner we get a representation for an arbitrary invariant curve of the map S .

This allows us to give the corresponding representation for solutions of equation (5). If $w(x)$ is a solution of equation (5) then

$$w(x) = \cot \left[\frac{1}{x} p \left(\frac{\ln x}{\ln 2} \right) \right], \quad x > \alpha$$

where p is a 1-periodic function given by the formula

$$p(x) = 2^x \cdot \operatorname{arccot} w(2^x) \quad \text{for } x \in (x_0, x_0 + 1], \quad x_0 = \frac{\ln \alpha}{\ln 2}.$$

The relation $w(x) = x\rho(x)$ gives the representation formula for the solution ρ of the Dido equation (1). Since $w(x) > 0$ for all $x > \alpha$, the function p must be such that

$$p \left(\frac{\ln x}{\ln 2} \right) < \frac{\pi}{2} x, \quad x > \alpha,$$

and consequently (4) holds. This ends the “only if” part of the proof. Since the “if” part is easy to verify, the proof is completed.

REMARK 3

For each $\alpha > 0$ there exists a lower bound for solutions of the Dido equation (1) on the domain $x > \alpha$, namely, the piecewise continuous function $\varrho_*(x) = \frac{1}{x} \cot \frac{\pi}{2^n}$ for $x \in (2^{n-1}\alpha, 2^n\alpha]$, $n = 1, 2, \dots$.

For any solution $\varrho : (\alpha, +\infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ of (1) we have

$$\varrho(x) > \varrho_*(x).$$

for all $x > \alpha$.

REMARK 4

Both the Dido equation (1) and equation (5) have no positive solutions defined on $(0, \infty)$. This is explained by the fact that the map S has no “full” trajectories, i.e. sets of the form $\{S^n(x, w) : n \in \mathbb{Z}\}$, contained in $(0, \infty)^2$; namely, for every $\alpha > 0$ there exists an integer $m > 0$ such that $S^{-m}((\alpha, \infty) \times (0, \infty)) \not\subseteq (0, \infty)^2$.

REMARK 5

There is full analogy between the notion of invariant function of a map and the notion of first integral (as a function preserving a fixed value along every solution) from the theory of ordinary differential equations. The invariant functions J_1 and J_2 may be also referred to as first integrals of the map S (cf. [2]). This analogy, as is seen from the proof of Theorem 1, can be continued: the relation between a functional equation and its characteristic map is similar to the relation between a partial differential equation and the system of ordinary differential equations for its characteristics.

4. Regular solutions at infinity

Applying Theorem 1 we obtain the following

THEOREM 2

Let $\alpha > 0$ be arbitrarily fixed. Suppose that $\varrho : (\alpha, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$ satisfies the Dido functional equation (1). If for some $a > 0$

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \varrho(x) = a, \quad (8)$$

then

$$\varrho(x) = \frac{1}{x} \cot \frac{1}{ax}, \quad x \in (\alpha, \infty). \quad (9)$$

This function actually satisfies equation (1) in the interval (α, ∞) if

$$a \geq \frac{2}{\pi\alpha}.$$

Moreover, if

$$a = \frac{2}{\pi\alpha}$$

then

$$\varrho(\alpha+) := \lim_{x \rightarrow \alpha+} \varrho(x) = 0.$$

Proof. Taking for the periodic function p the constant $\frac{1}{a}$ in Theorem 1 gives formula (9). The remaining statements are easy to verify.

REMARK 6

Theorem 2 improves the main result of [1] where, instead of (8), it is assumed that for some $a > 0$ and $q > 0$,

$$\varrho(x) = a + o(x^{-q}) \quad \text{as } x \rightarrow \infty.$$

5. Remarks about the Dido recurrence

Modifying in an obvious way the arguments used in the proof of Theorem 1, we get the following

THEOREM 3

Let $f : \mathbb{N}_2 \rightarrow [0, \infty)$ satisfy the recurrence (2). If, for some $a > 0$,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(n) = a,$$

then

$$f(n) = \frac{1}{n} \cot \frac{1}{an}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_2.$$

Moreover, f satisfies (2) in \mathbb{N}_2 if $a \geq \frac{1}{\pi}$, and, if $a = \frac{1}{\pi}$ then $f(2) = 0$. Furthermore, if $f(2) = 0$, then

$$f(n) < \frac{1}{\pi}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_2,$$

and

$$f(0) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(n) = \frac{1}{\pi}.$$

REMARK 7

According to the geometrical interpretation of the values $f(n)$ in Remark 1, the condition $f(2) = 0$ means that a regular polygon of order 2 has, by definition, a vanishing inner radius.

References

- [1] P. Kahlig, J. Matkowski, *On the Dido functional equation*, Ann. Math. Sil. (to appear).
- [2] G.P. Pelyukh, A.N. Sharkovsky, *Introduction to the Theory of Functional Equations* (in Russian), Naukova Dumka, Kiev, 1974.

P. Kahlig
Institut für Meteorologie und Geophysik
Universität Wien
UZA2, Althanstr. 14
A-1090 Wien
Austria
E-mail: peter.kahlig@univie.ac.at

J. Matkowski
Institute of Mathematics
Pedagogical University
Pl. Śłowiański 9
PL-65-069 Zielona Góra
Poland
and
Institute of Mathematics
Silesian University
Bankowa 14
PL-40-007 Katowice
Poland
E-mail: matkow@omega.im.wsp.zgora.pl

A.N. Sharkovsky
Institute of Mathematics
National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine
UA-252004 Kiev
Ukraine
E-mail: asharkov@imath.kiev.ua

Manuscript received: December 22, 1999 and in final form: March 8, 2000